

## **Appendix C: CDFG – OSPR Trustee Councils= Guideline to Restoration Project Evaluation Criteria**

**Phase I - THRESHOLD CRITERIA:** A project must meet the following criteria in order to be further considered and evaluated using the Screening Criteria below. If any project does not meet the Threshold Criteria, it will not be given further consideration.

- A. **Consistency with Trustees= Restoration Goals** Projects must meet the Trustees= intent to restore, rehabilitate, replace, enhance, or acquire the equivalent of the injured resources and resource services. In addition, projects must comply with applicable settlement documents.
- B. **Technical Feasibility**<sup>5</sup> The project must be technically and procedurally sound. Consider the level of risk or uncertainty and the degree of success of projects utilizing similar or identical techniques in the past.

**Phase II - INITIAL SCREENING CRITERIA:** The following initial screening criteria shall be used to determine preferred and non-preferred projects.

- C. **Relationship to Injured Resources and/or Services (nexus).**<sup>o 5</sup> Projects that restore rehabilitate, replace, enhance, or acquire the equivalent of the same or similar resources or services injured by the spill are preferred to projects that benefit other comparable resources or services. Consider the types of resources or services injured by the spill, the location, and the connection or Nexus<sup>@</sup> of project benefits to those injured resources.
- D. **Avoidance of Adverse Impacts.**<sup>o 5</sup> The project should avoid or minimize adverse impacts to the environment and the associated natural resources. Adverse impacts may be caused by collateral injuries when implementing, or as a result of implementing, the project. Consider avoiding future short-term and long-term injuries as well as mitigating past injuries.
- E. **Likelihood of Success.**<sup>o</sup> Consider the potential for success and the level of expected return of resources and resource services. Consider also the ability to evaluate the success of the project, the ability to correct problems that arise during the course of the project, and the capability of individuals or organizations expected to implement the project.
- F. **Multiple Resource [and Service] Benefits.**<sup>o</sup> Consider the extent to which the project benefits more than one natural resource or resource service. Measure in

<sup>o</sup> Required criterion under NOAA=s regulations for oil spills (15 C.F.R. ' 990.54)

<sup>5</sup> Required criterion under Interior=s regulations (43 C.F.R. ' 11.82)

terms of the quantity and associated quality of the types of natural resources or service benefits expected to result from the project.

- G. **Time to Provide Benefits.** Consider the time it takes for benefits to be provided to the target ecosystem or public to minimize interim resource loss (sooner = better).
- H. **Duration of Benefits.** Consider the expected duration of benefits from the project. Long-term benefits are the objective.

**Phase III - ADDITIONAL SCREENING CRITERIA:** The following additional screening criteria shall be used to further evaluate and prioritize projects for funding and implementation. These additional criteria are not considered to be of lesser importance than the initial screening criteria. However, in practice it may be difficult to apply these criteria to project concepts. These criteria are generally more appropriately applied after more detailed project plans and scopes of work are developed. If sufficient information is available, these criteria may also be used during the initial screening process.

- I. **Compliance with Applicable Federal, State, and Local Laws and Policies.**<sup>5</sup>  
The project must comply with appropriate laws and policies.
- J. **Public Health and Safety.**<sup>o 5</sup> The project must not pose a threat to public health and safety.
- K. **Protection of Project [Maintenance and Oversight].** Consider the opportunities to protect the implemented project and resulting benefits over time through conservation easements, land acquisition, or other types of resource dedication. Long-term protection is preferable.
- L. **Opportunities for Collaboration.** Consider the possibility of matching funds, in-kind services, volunteer assistance, and coordination with other ongoing or proposed projects. External funding and support services that reduce costs or extend benefits are preferable. Funds, however, shall not be used to offset the costs of ongoing mitigation projects required pursuant to state or federal law.
- M. **Cost-Effectiveness.**<sup>5</sup> Consider the relationship of expected project costs to expected resource and service benefits. Seek the least costly approach to deliver an equivalent or greater amount and type of benefits.
- N. **Total Cost and Accuracy of Estimate.**<sup>o</sup> The total cost estimate should include

<sup>o</sup> Required criterion under NOAA=s regulations for oil spills (15 C.F.R. ' 990.54)

<sup>5</sup> Required criterion under Interior=s regulations (43 C.F.R. ' 11.82)

costs to design, implement, monitor, and manage the project. Its validity is determined by the completeness, accuracy, and reliability of methods used to estimate costs, as well as the credibility of the person or entity submitting the estimate.

- O. **Comprehensive Range of Projects.** Consider the extent to which the project contributes to the more comprehensive restoration package. Evaluate the project for the degree to which it benefits any otherwise uncompensated spill injuries.

**Phase IV - SUPPLEMENTAL CRITERIA:** The following criteria should be considered when appropriate (e.g., in the case of more than one project being equally preferred after Phases I – III evaluations).

- P. **Ability to Document Benefits to the Public.** Consider the ability to document receipt or delivery of benefits to the public as a result of a project or other use of funds.
- Q. **Educational/Research Value.** Consider the project=s potential for public education and outreach and/or clarifying restoration planning issues.
- R. **Non-Duplication.** Projects should not duplicate other efforts already ongoing at the same location.

o Required criterion under NOAA=s regulations for oil spills (15 C.F.R. ' 990.54)  
5 Required criterion under Interior=s regulations (43 C.F.R. ' 11.82)